



Colorado River Basin Regional Water Quality Control Board

CERTIFIED MAIL: 7020 2450 0000 3275 3255

March 26, 2024

Tyler Salcido, City Manager
City of Brawley
180 South Western Avenue
Brawley, CA 92227
tsalcido@brawley-ca.gov

**SUBJECT: REVISED CONDITIONAL SETTLEMENT OFFER NO. R7-2024-0010:
OFFER TO PARTICIPATE IN EXPEDITED PAYMENT PROGRAM
RELATING TO ALLEGED VIOLATIONS OF ORDER NO. R7-2015-0004
AND R7-2021-0005, NPDES NO. CA0104523**

Dear Tyler Salcido:

This letter notifies the City of Brawley, Owner/Operator, Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant (Discharger) of alleged violation(s) of effluent limitations and provides the Discharger the opportunity to settle the violation(s) through payment of **\$12,000** in mandatory minimum penalties pursuant to California Water Code (Water Code) sections 13385 and/or 13385.1. Please reply by **April 25, 2024**.

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

The Assistant Executive Officer alleges that the Discharger has violated the above-referenced National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit as identified in Revised Exhibit A, attached hereto, and incorporated by reference. The Discharger can resolve the alleged violations as discussed below. Violation ID No. 1121384, for \$3,000 in Mandatory Minimum Penalties, has been excluded from Exhibit A, attached to Conditional Settlement Offer No. R7-2024-0010 issued on March 12, 2024. This resolves all outstanding violations to date.

PETER SATIN, CHAIR | PAULA RASMUSSEN, EXECUTIVE OFFICER

STATUTORY LIABILITY

Water Code section 13385, subdivisions (h) and (i), require the assessment of a \$3,000 mandatory minimum penalty for specified serious and chronic effluent limitation violations. The Discharger is also subject to discretionary administrative civil liability of up to \$10,000 per day for each violation, plus \$10 for each gallon discharged but not cleaned up in excess of 1,000 gallons. The Colorado River Basin Regional Water Quality Control Board (Regional Water Board) may assess mandatory minimum penalties or discretionary administrative civil liability beginning with the date on which the violations first occurred. The formal enforcement action that the Regional Water Board uses to assess such liability is an administrative civil liability complaint. Alternatively, the Regional Water Board may refer the matter to the Attorney General's Office for prosecution in the Superior Court. The Superior Court may assess up to \$25,000 per day for each violation, plus \$25 per gallon discharged but not cleaned up in excess of 1,000 gallons.

DISCHARGER'S OPTION:

PARTICIPATE IN EXPEDITED PAYMENT PROGRAM

The Discharger can avoid the issuance of a formal enforcement action and settle the alleged violation(s) identified in Revised Exhibit A by participating in the Regional Water Board's Expedited Payment Program. The Discharger may accept this Revised Conditional Settlement Offer, waive its right to a hearing, and pay the mandatory minimum penalty of **\$12,000** for the violation(s) described in Revised Exhibit A. If the Discharger elects to do so, the Regional Water Board will execute the settlement offer subject to the conditions below. The Regional Water Board will accept the payment in settlement of any enforcement action that would otherwise arise out of the violation(s) identified in Revised Exhibit A. Accordingly, the Regional Water Board will not issue a formal administrative civil liability complaint, will not refer the violation(s) to the Attorney General's Office, and will waive its right to seek additional discretionary civil liability for the violation(s) identified in Revised Exhibit A.

This Revised Conditional Settlement Offer does not address or resolve liability for any violation that is not specifically identified in Revised Exhibit A.

DISCHARGER'S OPTION FOR RESPONSE TO OFFER

To accept this Revised Conditional Settlement Offer, the Discharger must complete, sign, and return the enclosed "Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing" (Acceptance and Waiver) on or before **April 25, 2024 (30 days)**. The Acceptance and Waiver is provided as Revised Exhibit B (enclosed).

If the Discharger chooses to contest any of the violations alleged in Revised Exhibit A, please identify the specific violation(s) and the basis for the challenge (factual error, affirmative defense, etc.) on or before the due date specified above. Regional Water Board staff will evaluate the contested violation(s) and take one of two actions:

- 1) Determine that the violation(s) warrants dismissal, dismiss the alleged violation(s) in the California Integrated Water Quality System (CIWQS) database, notify the Discharger of the dismissal, and take no further action against the Discharger for the alleged violation(s); or
- 2) Determine that the alleged violation(s) is/are meritorious and notify the Discharger of that determination. The Discharger will then have 30 days from the date of the notice of determination to accept settlement for the violation by submitting a complete Acceptance and Waiver. If the Discharger chooses not to accept or makes no reply to the determination within 30 days, the Discharger will be contacted by the Regional Water Board staff regarding a formal enforcement proceeding for the contested violation(s). Information received by Regional Water Board staff during any formal investigation and assessment of the violation(s), as well as staff costs associated with pursuing the enforcement, may increase the liability beyond that set forth in this Conditional Settlement Offer.

CONDITIONS FOR REGIONAL WATER BOARD ACCEPTANCE OF RESOLUTION

Federal regulations require the Regional Water Board to publish and allow the public at least 30 days to comment on any settlement of an enforcement action addressing NPDES permit violations (40 C.F.R. section 123.27(d)(2)(iii)). Upon receipt of the Discharger's Acceptance and Waiver, Regional Water Board staff will publish a notice of the proposed resolution of the violation(s).

If Regional Water Board staff do not receive comments within the 30-day comment period and no new material facts become available to the Regional Water Board, the Executive Officer will execute the Acceptance and Waiver as a stipulated order assessing the uncontested mandatory minimum penalty amount pursuant to Water Code sections 13385 and/or 13385.1.

If, however, significant comments are received in opposition to the Settlement, the Offer may be withdrawn. In that case, the Discharger's waiver pursuant to the Acceptance and Waiver will also be treated as withdrawn and the violation(s) will be addressed in a liability assessment proceeding. At the liability assessment hearing the Discharger will be free to make arguments as to any of the alleged violations, and the Discharger's agreement to accept this conditional settlement offer will not in any way be binding or used as evidence against the Discharger. The Discharger will be provided with further information on the liability assessment proceeding.

In the event the Executive Officer executes the Acceptance and Waiver, full payment of the assessed amount shall be due within 30 calendar days from the date of the Executive Officer's signature. Funds collected for violations under Water Code sections 13385 and 13385.1 shall be deposited in the State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account. Accordingly, the **\$12,000** liability shall be paid by cashiers or certified check made out to the "State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account". Failure to pay the full penalty within the required time may subject the Discharger to further liability.

If the Discharger does not respond, he/she will be contacted regarding a formal enforcement action that will be initiated for the contested violations.

Please send your reply to the attention of Logan Raub, either by email or U.S. mail. If you want to discuss or have questions regarding this Conditional Settlement Offer, please contact Logan Raub by email at Logan.Raub@waterboards.ca.gov.

Sincerely,

Original Signed By

Cassandra Owens
Assistant Executive Officer
Colorado River Basin
Regional Water Quality Control Board

Enclosure: Revised Exhibit A – Mandatory Penalty Administrative Civil Liability
Revised Exhibit B - Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of
Right to Hearing

Cc:

Steven Mireles
Senior Environmental Compliance Officer
City of Brawley
smireles@brawley-ca.gov

File: WDID No. 7A130100011, City of Brawley WWTP

MANDATORY PENALTY ADMINISTRATIVE CIVIL LIABILITY

Brawley City

Brawley City WWTP

WDID No. 7A130100011 NPDES No. CA0104523

REVISED EXHIBIT "A"

Effluent Limitation Violations Requiring Mandatory Minimum Penalties

#	Violation Number	Violation Date	Constituent	Pollutant Group	Limitation Period	Limit	Result/Average	Units	% Over Limit	Date 180 Days Prior	Serious or Chronic Violation?	No. of Violations within 180 days	Mandatory Fine?	Water Code	Penalty
1	1091416	05/12/2021	E.coli	Other	Instantaneous	400	1600	MPN/100	N/A	11/13/2020	N/A	1	N		\$ 0
2	1091417	05/31/2021	Fecal Coliform	Other	10% for 30 days	400	1600	MPN/100	N/A	12/02/2020	N/A	2	N		\$ 0
3	1093644	07/28/2021	E.coli	Other	Maximum Daily	320	1600	MPN/100	N/A	01/29/2021	N/A	3	N		\$ 0
4	1095869	09/01/2021	E.coli	Other	6-Week Rolling	100	146.3	MPN/100	N/A	03/05/2021	C	4	Y	13385(i)	\$ 3,000
5	1095870	09/01/2021	E.coli	Other	Instantaneous	320	350	MPN/100	N/A	03/05/2021	C	5	Y	13385(i)	\$ 3,000
6	1108793	09/30/2022	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	16.7	17	ug/L	2%	04/03/2022	N/A	1	N		\$ 0
7	1110599	10/26/2022	E.coli	Other	Instantaneous	320	350	MPN/100	N/A	04/29/2022	N/A	2	N		\$ 0
8	1115093	02/15/2023	Copper, Total	Group 2	Monthly Average	16.7	17	ug/L	2%	08/19/2022	N/A	3	N		\$ 0
9	1115823	03/22/2023	E.coli	Other	Instantaneous	320	1600	MPN/100	N/A	09/23/2022	C	4	Y	13385(i)	\$ 3,000
10	1117235	04/06/2023	Ammonia, Total (as N)	Group 1	Maximum Daily	3.2	4.1	mg/L	28%	10/08/2022	C	4	Y	13385(i)	\$ 3,000

Total Penalty: \$ 12,000

1 - Violation occurs on sample date or last date of averaging period.

2 - For Group I pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 40% or more

- For Group II pollutants, a violation is serious when the limit is exceeded by 20% or more

3 - When a serious violation occurs on the same day as a chronic, the serious violation is only assessed an MMP once and is counted last for the day when determining the number of chronic violations to be assessed a

Violation period ending the last day of April 2023

Group I Violations Assessed MMP: 1

Group II Violations Assessed MMP: 0

Other Effluent Violations Assessed MMP: 3

Violations Exempt from MMP: 0

Total Violations Assessed MMP: 4

Mandatory Minimum Penalty = (0 Serious Violations + 4 Non-Serious Violations) x \$3,000 = \$12,000

REVISED EXHIBIT B
ACCEPTANCE OF CONDITIONAL RESOLUTION
AND WAIVER OF RIGHT TO HEARING

City of Brawley, Owner/Operator
Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant
WDRs Order Nos. R7-2015-0004 and R7-2021-0005 (NPDES No. CA0104523)

By signing below and returning this Acceptance of Conditional Resolution and Waiver of Right to Hearing (Acceptance and Waiver) to the California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin Region (Regional Water Board), the City of Brawley, Owner/Operator, Brawley Wastewater Treatment Plant (Discharger) hereby accepts the revised conditional settlement offer to settle the alleged violations through payment of mandatory minimum penalties and waives the right to a hearing before the Regional Water Board to dispute the alleged violations. The alleged violations are attached to this Acceptance and Waiver as 'Revised Exhibit A' and incorporated by reference.

The Discharger agrees that 'Revised Exhibit A' shall serve as a Complaint pursuant to Article 2.5 of the California Water Code and that no separate Complaint is required for the Regional Water Board to assert jurisdiction over the alleged violations through its Assistant Executive Officer. The Discharger agrees to pay the penalties required by California Water Code sections 13385 and/or 13385.1, in the sum of **\$12,000** (Expedited Payment Amount), which shall be deemed payment in full of any civil liability pursuant to Water Code section 13385 that otherwise might be assessed for the violation(s) described in 'Revised Exhibit A'. The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver waives its right to contest the allegations in 'Revised Exhibit A' and the amount of civil liability assessed for the violations.

The Discharger understands that this Acceptance and Waiver does not address or resolve liability for any violation that is not specifically identified in 'Revised Exhibit A'.

Upon execution by the Discharger, the completed Acceptance and Waiver shall be returned to:

California Regional Water Quality Control Board, Colorado River Basin
Attention: Logan Raub
73720 Fred Waring Drive, Suite 100
Palm Desert, CA 92260

The Discharger understands that federal regulations set forth at Code of Federal Regulations, title 40, section 123.27(d)(2)(iii) require the Regional Water Board to publish notice of and provide at least thirty (30) days for public comment on any proposed resolution of an enforcement action addressing NPDES permit violations. Accordingly, this Acceptance and Waiver will be published as required by law for public comment prior to the Executive Officer's execution.

The Discharger understands that if no comments are received within the public notice period that causes the Executive Officer to question the conditional settlement offer, the Executive Officer will execute this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that if significant comments are received in opposition to the conditional settlement offer, the offer may be withdrawn. In that circumstance, the Discharger will be advised of the withdrawal and an administrative civil liability complaint may be issued and the matter may be set for a hearing before the Regional Water Board. For such a liability hearing, the Discharger understands that its executed Acceptance and Waiver will be treated as a settlement communication and will not be used as evidence in that hearing.

The Discharger understands that once the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver, the full payment required by the deadline set forth below is a condition of this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger understands that funds collected for violations under Water Code sections 13385 and 13385.1 shall be deposited in the State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account. Accordingly, the liability shall be paid by a cashier's or certified check for **\$12,000** made out to the "State Water Pollution Cleanup and Abatement Account."

The Discharger understands that payment must be submitted to the State Water Resources Control Board no later than thirty (30) calendar days after the date on which the Executive Officer executes this Acceptance and Waiver.

The Discharger shall mail the check to:

State Water Resources Control Board
Division of Administrative Services, Accounting Branch
Attn: ACL Payment
PO Box 1888
Sacramento, CA 95812-1888

I hereby affirm that I am duly authorized to act on behalf of and to bind the Discharger in the making and giving of this Acceptance and Waiver.

City of Brawley WWTP

By: Original Signed By 4/08/2024
Signed Name Date

Tyler Salcido City Manager
Printed or Typed Name Title

Note: Please return the signed Acceptance and Waiver with Revised Exhibit A, together.

IT IS SO ORDERED PURSUANT TO WATER CODE SECTION 13385.

By: _____ Date _____
PAULA RASMUSSEN
Executive Officer